

Environment Scrutiny Panel

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th January 2010

Meeting Number: 18

Present	Deputy P Rondel (Chairman) (PR) Deputy D Wimberley (Vice Chairman) (DW) Connétable J Refault (JR) Deputy P Le Claire (PLC)
In attendance	M Haden , Scrutiny Officer M. Orbell, Scrutiny Officer

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	<p>1. Records of meetings</p> <p>The minutes of the meeting held on 16th December 2009 were approved and signed</p>	
	<p>2. Matters arising</p> <p>Item 5 27.11.09 i) Carbon Intensity Study - The Panel was informed that a productive meeting of representatives of all the energy suppliers had been held on 7th January 2010 and that a further meeting to agree the scope of the study had been scheduled for 11th February 2010.</p> <p>Item 10 16.11.09 (ii) Ministerial decision on Budget transfers - The Panel noted a brief report from the Director of Municipal Services explaining the position.</p> <p>Item 1 02.11.09 (iii) Funding Waste Recycling: Ministerial response - The Panel was informed that a response would be forwarded shortly.</p> <p>Item 3 16.12.09 (iv) Building Control - It was noted that Mr. Baudains had not received a response from the Minister</p>	
<p>Item 4 16.12.09 514/9(8)</p>	<p>3. Energy from Waste Plant and Ramsar: Review of Planning Process</p> <p>The Panel noted that a report of the alleged pollution incident in April 2010 (which had been the subject of a criminal investigation by the Water Regulator) had now been posted on the Save Our Shoreline website. The Panel itself had received no further communication from the former Project Manager for the Energy from Waste plant. The Panel recalled that it had agreed to review aspects of environmental monitoring in a follow up report and agreed that it would take account of the pollution incident in that report.</p> <p>The Panel was informed that the finalisation of its report had involved a considerable degree of consultation with the adviser. In view of this the Panel agreed to uplift its budget estimate by £2,000.</p>	

Item 6

16.12.09

4. Panel Work Programme 2010

The Panel gave further consideration to its work programme for 2010.

(a) Island Plan Review: The Panel noted that there were links in the draft Plan to key developing policy issues of major interest to its work programme, notably transport policy and the liquid waste strategy. The Panel agreed that it would monitor the outcome of the independent review process rather than make any intervention at this stage.

(b) Management of the Marine Environment: The Panel agreed that it would be appropriate to follow up its review of the planning process for the Energy from Waste Plant and Ramsar with a broader focus on the environmental regulation and monitoring and protection regimes around coastal waters. Issues to be investigated could include

- Monitoring the impact of effluent discharge through sewer outfalls into St Aubin's Bay and Bonne Nuit
- Progress on work to ensure compliance of Bellozanne Treatment works with discharge permits under the Water Pollution (Jersey) Law 2000,
- Monitoring the discharge of storm water and emergency sewage spillage
- Levels of compliance with EU bathing water quality standards
- Monitoring the nitrate and bacterial loading from discharges from surface water outfalls and run-offs around the Island
- Pollution testing in Elizabeth Marina
- Monitoring the impact of residues of airport fire fighting chemicals and potato leachate
- The impact of the above on marine eco-systems and aquaculture.
- The development of a management plan for the Ramsar area

The Panel recalled a recent discussion with the Comptroller and Auditor General who had announced an investigation into Environmental Protection and Regulation in May 2009 and noted that this review had not yet progressed, partly due to difficulties finding expert advice to cover the broad scope of his review. The Panel noted that its proposed study might cover some elements of the Comptroller and Auditor's General's proposed investigation, but that it would be important to keep a tight focus to ensure a review could be completed within a reasonable time-frame.

It was recalled that the previous Environment Panel had carried out some preliminary research into the monitoring of water quality but had not undertaken a formal review due to other work load issues.

It was also suggested that the Panel should consider the implications of potential exploitation of tidal energy which was being investigated by a working party established by the Planning and Environment Department.

Having noted that the next Quarterly Briefing with the Minister for Planning and Environment was scheduled for 10th February the Panel agreed to advise the Minister that it wished to have a preliminary discussion on the above issues.

The Panel requested that a visit be arranged for members to view sewer

MH/MO

	<p>and surface water outfalls</p> <p>The Officers were instructed to prepare scoping for the proposed review for consideration at the next Panel meeting.</p> <p>c) Liquid Waste Strategy The Panel noted that the above proposed review could have links with a future proposed review of the Liquid Waste Strategy which was due to be published in consultation form by Transport and Technical Services by in the second quarter of the year. The Panel agreed to request a briefing from the Minister at the next quarterly meeting.</p> <p>d) Disposal of food waste: The Panel noted that the Parish of St Helier had recently initiated a project to compost food waste. The Scrutiny officer was requested to prepare a report on the ways in which food waste in general was disposed of in the Island.</p> <p>e) Highway maintenance: The Connétable of St Peter informed the Panel about problems experienced regarding the resurfacing of roads after work carried out by utility companies. The Panel agreed to ask the Minister for Transport and Technical Services for an update on progress with drafting legislation on street works.</p> <p>f) Energy Efficiency in States Buildings It was agreed to defer this review to later in the year.</p>	MH
	<p>5. Draft Annual Report</p> <p>The Panel approved a draft Annual report for 2009 for submission to the Chairmen's Committee.</p> <p>The Panel noted that in planning its work programme for 2009 it had expected to focus its attention on a number of planned major policy developments including the Liquid Waste Strategy, the Sustainable Transport Plan and the Energy Policy, all of which had been expected to be presented to the States for approval during the year. In the event these policies were still work in progress. The Panel agreed that a balanced work programme should also contain issues selected by the Panel or proposed by members of the public where the Panel could take a more proactive role in investigating issues of public concern. Such reviews showed the strength of the Scrutiny process.</p> <p>Officers were requested to research a public survey tool available on the Internet to improve public engagement with the Scrutiny process.</p>	MO/MH
	<p>6 Panel expenditure</p> <p>The Panel noted a report of its expenditure to the end of the year 2009</p>	
	<p>7 Chairmen's Committee</p> <p>Briefing notes for the meeting held on 17th Dec 2009 were noted</p>	
	<p>8. Scrutiny Away morning</p> <p>The Panel received notes from the workshop sessions held on 14th January 2010</p>	
	<p>9. Ministerial decisions</p> <p>Recent Ministerial decisions pertinent to the Panel's remit were noted.</p>	

	<p>10. Questions in the States to the Ministers for Planning and Environment and Transport and Technical Services</p> <p>There was a suggestion that a file should be maintained by the Scrutiny Officers of all written and oral questions in the States relevant to the Panel's remit. It was noted that another Panel had previously attempted to keep a similar record but that the effort had proved unproductive. It was agreed that officers would carry out a trial run to see whether keeping such records on file proved useful.</p>	MO/MH
	<p>11. Any Other Business</p> <p>a) Provision of Bottled Water in States Departments - The Chairman asked officers to follow up his questions to the Environment Department on the cost and sustainability of providing bottled water to States departments</p> <p>b) P1/2010 Waterfront Planning Application: Zephyrus Scheme: The Chairman expressed concern that Deputy Wimberley had prematurely made use of confidential information from the Panel's review in support of his proposition. He believed that this was in contravention of the Scrutiny Code of Practice. It was also pointed out that such actions potentially damaged communication between the department and the Panel. The Chairman asked Deputy Wimberley to give an assurance that this would not happen in future reviews.</p> <p>The Chairman also noted that names of officers rather than their titles had been used in the original proposition; however, this error had now been rectified in the reissued proposition.</p>	MH
	<p>12. Future meetings</p> <p>The Panel noted the following meetings:</p> <p>1st February 2010: Briefing with Bus Consultants (Aecom)</p> <p>10th February 2010 Quarterly Briefing with Minister for Planning and Environment Minister</p> <p>11th February 2010: Next scheduled Panel meeting</p> <p>26th February 2010: Quarterly Briefing with Minister for Transport and Technical Services</p>	

Signed

Date:

P. J. Rendell

11/2/10

Chairman Environment Panel